

CITY OF ST. AUGUSTINE
Historic Architectural Review Board Regular Meeting
July 15, 2010

The Historic Architectural Review Board met in formal session at 2:00 P.M., Thursday, July 15, 2010, in the Alcazar Room at City Hall, St. Augustine, Florida. Fred Halback, Chairman, called the meeting to order, and the following were present:

1. ROLL CALL: Fred Halback, Chairman
Leslie Thomas
Paul Weaver, III
Ken Smith

Absent: Len Weeks, Vice-Chairperson (Excused)

City Staff: David Birchim, Planning Manager
Mark Knight, Director, Planning and Building
Melissa Dezendorf, Special Projects Manager
Carlos Mendoza, Assistant City Attorney
Carly Mason, Recording Secretary

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES
June 17, 2010 Regular Meeting

The minutes of the June 17, 2010 Regular HARB meeting were approved as presented.

3. Certificate of Appropriateness

Item 3 (a) F2010-0042

W. Justin Reid, Casa Monica Hotel –
Owner/Applicant
95 Cordova Street¹
(Previously Tabled)

To paint trim on the building.

Ms. Dezendorf said based on the review of the Architectural Guidelines for Historic Preservation (AGHP), staff found that the board could DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE the painting of the exterior trim at 95 Cordova Street, until more detailed plans and color scheme were submitted.

Ms. Dezendorf said the applicant would reapply once all information was collected.

¹ Staff report attached to original minutes

Public hearing opened; however, there was no response.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE Certificate of Appropriateness application F2010-0042. Motion SECONDED by Mr. Smith.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Smith, Thomas, Halback

NAYES: NONE
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Item 3 (b) F2010-0053

Darrell Samples – Applicant
The St. Augustine Foundation, Inc. –
Owner
58 Cuna Street²

To install a historic exhibit panel.

Ms. Dezendorf said based on the review of information submitted by the applicant, the Architectural Guidelines for Historic

² Staff report attached to original minutes

Preservation, applicable City ordinances and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff found that the board could APPROVE the Certificate of Appropriateness application to install a historic exhibit sign at 58 Cuna Street with the following conditions:

- Sign foundation posts would be black-powder coated metal
- Construction process to include a coquina shell-dash concrete base

Darrell Samples, applicant, provided a sample of the proposed signage. He said the sign would be two dimensional, three feet from the ground and secured with two metal posts.

Mr. Thomas asked if the sign would be posted behind the fence, and the response was affirmative.

Mr. Halback questioned whether there had been vandalism along St. George Street and the response was no.

Mr. Halback suggested that recessing and placing a notch in the fence could provide a better view. He said the signs should be uniform and handicap accessible.

Mr. Thomas questioned the location of the sign.

Mr. Samples replied that the sign would be located on the corner of Spanish Street.

Public hearing opened; however, there was no response.

MOTION

Mr. Thomas MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness application F2010-0053 to include a notch in fence, height of sign be consistent with surrounding signs (three feet) and staff comments. Motion SECONDED by Mr. Smith.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Thomas, Smith, Weaver, Halback

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Item 3 (c) F2010-0055

Don Crichlow, Architect – Applicant
George Arnold, 74 Spanish Street, LLC – Owner
74 Spanish Street³

To demolish a building built circa 1865 and build a new Second Spanish Period-style commercial and residential building.

Ms. Dezendorf said based on the review of information submitted by the applicant, the Architectural Guidelines for Historic Preservation, applicable City ordinances, and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff found that the board could APPROVE the expedited demolition and Certificate of Appropriateness application for 74 Spanish Street with the following guidelines:

- Board would approve the demolition for the existing building located at 74 Spanish Street
- Doors on the upper and lower stories would be changed to a more appropriate colonial design
- Period-correct plantings for landscape plan

Mr. Halback asked staff for clarification regarding the status of the application. He said previous testimony had been provided regarding the structure and its surroundings. He said that the board would be considering whether the proposal was appropriate for the site. He concluded that approval of the proposal would advance the demolition date.

Mr. Birchim replied that a Certificate of Demolition was approved on February 22, 2010, which required a waiting period of 12

³ Staff report attached to original minutes

months before demolition could take place. He said the applicant requested a reconsideration of the demolition, and allow a presentation for a replacement structure. He said the owner had secured the building from vandalism and weather elements, and felt he had done so in good faith.

Exparte Communication:

Mr. Weaver stated that he spoke to Mr. Crichlow regarding the compatibility of using a Spanish style building.

Don Crichlow, applicant, requested that the application be tabled until the August 19, 2010 meeting.

Mr. Thomas questioned whether the applicant would need to obtain a demolition permit.

Mr. Birchim replied that the applicant would need to attend the August Historic Architectural Review Board (HARB) meeting and request approval for a Certificate of Demolition and a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow a replacement structure.

Public hearing opened; however, there was no response.

Mr. Weaver said the application should be considered as an Opinion of Appropriateness, and felt that the project was still in the conceptual stage.

Mr. Crichlow stated that the documentation was complete and no new information would be added.

Mr. Smith asked if the building was set on the North property line, and the response was affirmative.

Mr. Halback asked the applicant to provide all details of the project at the subsequent meeting.

MOTION

Mr. Smith MOVED to TABLE Certificate of Appropriateness application F2010-0055 until August 19, 2010. Motion SECONDED by Mr. Weaver.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Smith, Weaver, Thomas, Halback

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Item 3 (d) F2010-0059

**Charles & Sandra Harmon – Owner/Applicants
63 Marine Street⁴**

To install a therapeutic swim spa.

Ms. Dezendorf said based on the review of information submitted by the applicant, the Architectural Guidelines for Historic Preservation, applicable City ordinances and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff found that the board could APPROVE the Certificate of Appropriateness application for a swim spa at 63 Marine Street.

Mr. Weaver asked staff whether Carl Halbirt, City Archeologist, would be performing an excavation of the site, and the response was affirmative.

Mr. Halback questioned the dimension, location, and height of the swim spa.

Kenneth Darnold, applicant, replied that the depth would be four feet with two feet being above ground. He said the spa would have a rectangular shape including a stucco face with eight inch tile around the spa. He concluded that an eight foot fence would surround the spa.

Public hearing opened; however, there was no response.

MOTION

⁴ Staff report attached to original minutes

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness application F2010-0059 as submitted. Motion SECONDED by Mr. Smith.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Smith, Thomas, Halback

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Item 3 (e) F2010-0060

John Cunningham, Ann O'Malley's Tavern – Applicant/Owner
23 Orange Street⁵

To install two ceiling fans on the front porch.

Ms. Dezendorf said based on the review of the information submitted by the applicant, the Architectural Guidelines for Historic Preservation, applicable City ordinances and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff found that the Board could APPROVE the Certificate of Appropriateness application for ceiling fans at 23 Orange Street.

John Cunningham, applicant, said the ceiling fans would not be noticeable from the street, and would provide additional air flow for patrons.

Public hearing opened; however, there was no response.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE application F2010-0060 as submitted. Motion SECONDED by Mr. Thomas.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Thomas, Smith, Halback

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

⁵ Staff report attached to original minutes

Item 3 (f) F2010-0050

Dana Ste. Claire, Dept. of Heritage Tourism – Applicant
Mark Alexander, Cuna Properties LLC – Owner
20 Castillo Drive⁶

To remove a window and replace with a door and install a handicap ramp.

Ms. Dezendorf said based on the review of the information submitted by the applicant, the Architectural Guidelines for Historic Preservation, applicable City ordinances and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff found that the board could APPROVE the Certificate of Appropriateness application for a new door and a handicap ramp at 20 Castillo Drive with the following conditions:

- Wood utilized for the ramp would not be pressure-treated modern lumber
- If existing Pecan Tree was removed, applicant would apply for a tree removal permit

Mr. Thomas recused himself due to a conflict of interest.

Mr. Halback said he had developed and completed the Master plan for Aviles Street. He reported that he had been paid in full for the project; therefore, he had no financial gain and would not need to recuse himself.

Dana Ste. Claire, Heritage Tourism/Historic Preservation and 450th Commemoration Director, explained that the City would be leasing an interpretive/visitor center from the Alexander family. He said plans would include a trolley drop off point, and a replica of Menendez's flagship, which would be built onsite. He noted that a door and handicap ramp would be required to make the building functional.

Public hearing opened; however, there was no response.

⁶ Staff report attached to original minutes

Mr. Smith asked whether modern treated wood could be used, and the response was affirmative.

Mr. Weaver questioned whether paint or stain could be used, and the response was affirmative.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness application F2010-0050 to include standard/pressure treated wood and appropriate stained or painted color. Motion SECONDED by Mr. Smith.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Smith, Halback

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Item 3 (g) F2010-0057

Martha S. Graham, Dept. of Public Works – Applicant
City of St. Augustine – Owner
Citywide⁷

To install recycling bins throughout the City (including HP Districts)

Ms. Dezendorf said based on the review of the information submitted by the applicant, the Architectural Guidelines for Historic Preservation, applicable City ordinances and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff found that the board could APPROVE the Certificate of Appropriateness application based on the following condition:

- Board approved of one or more of the proposed recycling containers

Mr. Birchim stated that the bins would be placed adjacent to the trash containers. He said that additional recycling bins would be added during special events.

⁷ Staff report attached to original minutes

Mr. Weaver said he preferred the black steel and plastic lumber bins, and felt the faux wood would be more appropriate for the Colonial style.

Mr. Birchim said the bins would primarily be used in the HP-1 and HP-2 districts.

Mr. Halback suggested that the black steel and plastic lumber bins be used in the historic districts and the “Woodie” outdoor containers could be used in the surrounding neighborhoods.

Mr. Weaver questioned whether the Lightner building was located in the HP-4 district.

Mr. Birchim replied that the Lightner building, Flagler College and Casa Monica were part of the HP-4 district.

Mr. Weaver said the black steel bins would be most appropriate in the HP-4 district.

Public hearing opened.

Robert Hall, resident, stated that he was in favor of the application. He questioned who would be responsible for recycling pickup.

Mr. Birchim replied that City staff would be responsible.

Mr. Halback asked if residential recycling was retrieved from the City or a contractor, and the response was a contractor.

Public hearing closed.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness application F2010-0057 to recommend plastic lumber# 4 for HP-1, 2, 3, black steel bins for HP-4 and Visitor Information Center. Motion SECONDED by Mr. Thomas.

Motion amended to include black steel recycle bins along Aviles Street starting at King Street extending to Cadiz Street.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Thomas, Smith,
Halback

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Item 3 (h) F2010-0058

Martha S. Graham, Dept. of Public Works
– Applicant
City of St. Augustine – Owner
Aviles Street⁸

Revision of previously approved sidewalk plans.

Ms. Dezendorf said based on the review of the Architectural Guidelines for Historic Preservation (AGHP) and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff found that the board could APPROVE a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as submitted.

Mr. Halback recused himself due to a conflict of interest.

Mr. Thomas asked if the shaded area on the site plan would be changed from brick to coquina concrete, and the response was affirmative.⁹

Mr. Smith asked if Sabal Palm plantings were included in the brick crossings, and the response was affirmative.

Mr. Weaver asked if the recycled street bricks had been collected from surrounding streets, and the response was affirmative.

Mr. Smith questioned the curb material and whether the pavers would tie in to the back side of the curb, and the response was affirmative.

Ms. Dezendorf replied that granite would be used for the curb.

Public hearing opened; however, there was no response.

⁸ Staff report attached to original minutes

⁹ Map attached to original minutes

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness application F2010-0058 as submitted. Motion SECONDED by Mr. Smith.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Smith, Thomas

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

4. Certificates of Demolition

4. (a) F2010-0061 Alice Long Owens – Applicant/Owner
250 Riberia Street¹⁰

To demolish a structure (circa 1924).

Ms. Dezendorf said based on the review of information submitted by the applicant, the Architectural Guidelines for Historic Preservation, applicable City ordinances, and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff found that the board could TABLE the Certificate of Demolition application for the building located at 250 Riberia Street until the additional information was provided as follows:

- A structural assessment report by a qualified building inspector
- Proof of financial hardship
- Provide clear photographs of the interior and exterior of the building, that showed current conditions
- Replacement plans for new construction

Alice Long Owens, applicant, was sworn in.

Colin Bingham, contractor, said he had provided pictures and a detailed report of the structure. He said the physical structure of the property would not be suitable for salvaging.

Mr. Halback asked for clarification regarding the specific requirements for performing an

¹⁰ Staff report attached to original minutes

assessment report and who would be qualified to do so.

Ms. Dezendorf replied that Section 28-89 of the City Code stated that a condition assessment report from an architect or structural engineer licensed in the State of Florida was required to demonstrate experience in historic restoration rehabilitation as to the structural soundness of the building and adaptability for continued use.

Mr. Halback felt that the City Code was very specific.

Mr. Birchim stated that historically the City had allowed a signed report from the City Building Official, provided the structure was uninhabitable and on an abatement list.

Mr. Weaver said he had completed the National Register for Lincolnton, and he noted that the home was considered a contributing home during the 1980's. He said wood drop siding with corner board was used for the exterior during that time.

Mr. Halback explained that he would not want to set a precedence for others to come forward in the future with the same type of demolition request. He said the board would need to determine whether the structure was still a contributing factor to the National Historic Register.

After a brief discussion the board determined that the information gathered from the Florida Master Site File, photos, and descriptions of the building were all key elements that indicated the structure was no longer considered a contributing building.

Mr. Thomas questioned whether the structure was still occupied by the owner and the response was affirmative.

Public hearing opened; however, there was no response.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of DEMOLITION application F2010-0061 due to the structure no longer being considered a contributing building based on staff comments, photos, testimony, and the Florida Master Site File. Motion SECONDED by Mr. Smith.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Smith, Thomas, Halback

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

5. Planning and Building Director's Report

Mr. Knight thanked staff and Mr. Weaver for attending the phone conference regarding the registration of Fullerwood into the National District

6. Other Business

Ms. Dezendorf announced that the "Friends of A1A Scenic and Historic Coastal Byway" received a grant award that would allow a cell phone tour to be developed and implemented. She explained that the tour would allow people to dial designated numbers listed on the sign and listen to historic information. She said the sign markers would be 12 inches wide by 18 inches long, and would be posted at the following locations:

- Visitors Information Center (VIC)
- Government House
- Flagler College
- Castillo de San Marcos
- Bridge of Lions

Ms. Dezendorf said pre-approved colors were utilized during the design process, and the Friends of A1A requested that a design to be chosen by the board.

Mr. Halback questioned the type of material to be used for mounting the signs.

Mr. Birchim replied that he was unsure; however, the sign at the VIC would be mounted to the wall.

Mr. Halback requested that the type and location of the mount be provided at a subsequent meeting.

After a brief discussion the board chose option # 3.¹¹

6. (a) Signage Material Update

Mr. Birchim said some of the downtown merchants had installed signs that were not in compliance with the City code. He indicated that Sintra/Komatex products had been widely used throughout the HP district. He explained that a procedure was now in place to avoid incorrect signage material from being installed without proper approval. He asked that the board allow the use of the MDO product and existing signage would remain with the current merchant; however, proper signage would be installed by new merchants. He provided a list of signage material as follows:

- Sintra or Komatex
- Multiple Density Overlay (MDO)
- High Density Overlay (HDU)
- Max-Metal

After a brief discussion the board agreed to discontinue use of the Sintra/Komatex product and allow staff's approval for the use of the HDU product.

Ms. Dezendorf asked for the board's opinion regarding the use of computer generated signs.

After a brief discussion the board asked to provide additional examples and to provide further information at the subsequent meeting.

Mr. Smith questioned whether hand painted signs were still an option and the response was affirmative.

¹¹ Attached to original minutes

Mr. Birchim suggested holding a workshop to discuss the possible changes to the HP Guidelines regarding the different architectural styles other than colonial.

Mr. Halback said he would prefer that the discussion take place during a regular HARB meeting.

7. Review of Conflict of Statements from Previous Meetings

(NONE)

8. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:54 P.M.¹²

Fred Halback, Chairperson

¹² Transcribed by Carly Mason