

**CITY OF ST. AUGUSTINE**  
Historic Architectural Review Board Regular Meeting  
May 20, 2010

The Historic Architectural Review Board met in formal session at 2:00 P.M., Thursday, May 20, 2010, in the Alcazar Room at City Hall, St. Augustine, Florida. Fred Halback, Chairman, called the meeting to order, and the following were present:

**1. ROLL CALL:** Fred Halback, Chairman  
Len Weeks, Vice-Chairperson  
Leslie Thomas  
Paul Weaver, III  
Ken Smith

City Staff: Mark Knight, Planning and Building, Director  
David Birchim, Planning Manager  
Melissa Dezendorf, Special Projects Manager  
Carlos Mendoza, Assistant City Attorney  
Carly Mason, Recording Secretary

---

**2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**  
**April 15, 2010 Regular Meeting**

The minutes of the April 15, 2010 Regular HARB meeting were approved as presented.

**3. Certificate of Appropriateness**

**Item 3 (a) F2010-0011**

**Rhett's St. Augustine, LLC –**  
**Owner/Applicant**  
**66 Hypolita Street<sup>1</sup>**  
**(Previously Tabled)**

**To remove the existing wood gate and replace with a masonry wall and metal gate and to remove existing doors and windows and replace with wood and glass panel sliding doors and to approve exterior gas light fixtures.**

Mr. Birchim said based on the review of information submitted, staff found that the Board could APPROVE a Certificate of Appropriateness for modifications to the façade of 66 Hypolita Street.

Les Thomas and Ken Smith recused themselves due to a conflict of interest.

John Arbizzani, applicant, said the board's comments were added to the architectural drawings, and he provided the board with updated plans.

Following a brief review Mr. Weaver said the updated plans appeared to be compatible.

Mr. Weeks questioned whether the proposed door would resemble a one-sided gate door, whether a fixed transom would be used, if the two lights near the door would remain, the type of paver to be used and paint color choices

Mr. Arbizzani replied that the doors would be similar to the sliding gate, existing paint colors would be used, existing lights would remain near the door, and coquina tabby pavers would be used.

Public hearing opened.

Robert Hall said he felt the materials used should be compatible with the colonial style, and he asked for clarification.

---

<sup>1</sup> Staff report attached to original minutes

Mr. Weeks said the proposed door would replicate the original style, which would be more appropriate.

Mr. Weaver pointed out that the board felt the original design introduced the colonial element into a simple vernacular building.

Public hearing closed.

## **MOTION**

**Mr. Weeks MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness application F2010-0011 to include all items discussed such as tabby pavers and paint colors. Motion SECONDED by Mr. Weaver.**

### **VOTE ON MOTION:**

**AYES: Weeks, Weaver, Halback**

**NAYES: NONE**

**MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

### **Item 3 (b) F2010-0041**

**Don Crichlow, Architect –Applicant**  
**George Arnold – Owner**  
**22 Avenida Menendez<sup>2</sup>**

**To install new windows, doors, railings, light fixtures, fences and gates, balconies and exterior ornamentations.**

Mr. Birchim said based on the review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff found that the Board could approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new building and site improvements as submitted by the applicant for 22 Avenida Menendez. He said the features that were labeled on the plans “actual design to be selected by owner” would be approved under a separate application.

Don Crichlow, Architect, said the existing roof would remain and would not be included in the certificate request. He

<sup>2</sup> Staff report attached to original minutes

provided the board with photos of the building modifications. He said the property would include the following:

### **Front:**

- Front door would have a custom made surround

### **East elevation front entrance:**

- 16 inch terra cotta medallions inset into wall

### **North elevation:**

- Window to include exterior stone masonry grille

### **East/West elevation:**

- Install columns
- Black rail design would be placed throughout the property
- Gate grilles would be installed over the doors

### **Rear of building:**

- Reliefs installed along wall
- Copper roof installed over second floor deck
- Metal aluminum grille to surround the roof

### **Light Fixtures:**

- Picture A: East elevation, over entrance door
- Picture B: Either side of entrance door
- Picture C: Southside elevation, balcony
- Picture D: Rear
- Picture E: Rear, fencing

Mr. Crichlow provided the board with paver samples, hardware, and risers and treads, for front door. He said Pecky Cypress

would be used under the soffits and balconies.

Ken Smith said the items appeared to be appropriate for the structure; however, he expressed concern about the location of the entry door fixtures and suggested lowering the fixtures to meet the door head.

Mr. Thomas suggested that the end of the copper roof be hip instead of gable.

Mr. Weeks said the wrought iron selected for the Mediterranean style was appropriate, and he appreciated the applicant using the salvaged architectural details.

Mr. Weaver questioned whether the east elevation windows on the second level would remain, and the response was affirmative.

Mr. Crichlow replied that two casement windows would be used for balcony access, which would also function as doors, and another window would be re-centered over the entrance door using a nine-over-nine double-hung window.

Mr. Weeks questioned the color choice of the wrought iron, and the response was black.

George Arnold, property owner, said the balconies would be bronze, and the fencing and gates would be rock aluminum black.

Mr. Halback said he concurred with the board; however, he asked for clarification regarding the wording "actual design to be selected by owner". He asked that drawings be returned to the board when completed. He questioned whether the windows were custom made wooden windows, and the response was affirmative.

Mr. Crichlow replied that once a shop drawing was completed he would provide a copy. He said the plan provided the location and type of windows.

Public hearing opened.

Robert Hall expressed support of the application.

Public hearing closed.

Mr. Weeks questioned whether additional details related to the manufacturer and colors for the windows could be provided at a subsequent meeting, and the response was affirmative.

#### **MOTION**

**Mr. Weeks MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness application F2010-0041 as submitted with approved changes (entrance surround carving, windows, paint colors, doors, gate hardware, landscape planting, and exterior landscape lighting.) Motion SECONDED by Mr. Weaver.**

#### **VOTE ON MOTION:**

**AYES: Weeks, Weaver, Thomas, Smith, Halback**

**NAYES: NONE**

**MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

#### **Item 3 (c) F2010-0040**

**Elaine Darnold –Applicant**  
**Charles & Mary Steadham – Owners**  
**178 Avenida Menendez<sup>3</sup>**

**To install railing and balusters for third floor deck.**

Mr. Birchim said based on the review of the AGHP, staff found that the Board could APPROVE a Certificate of Appropriateness for railings and balusters on a widow's walk and trim work at 178 Avenida Menendez as submitted.

Mr. Weeks questioned whether the balusters were the only change, and the response was affirmative.

---

<sup>3</sup> Staff report attached to original minutes

Exparte Communication:

Mr. Smith had a brief discussion with Elaine Darnold regarding the name of the original architect.

Public hearing opened; however, there was no response.

**MOTION**

**Mr. Smith MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness application F2010-0040 as submitted. Motion SECONDED by Mr. Thomas.**

**VOTE ON MOTION:**

**AYES: Smith, Thomas, Weaver, Weeks, Halback**

**NAYES: NONE**

**MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

**Item 3 (d) F2010-0039**

**Michael Davis – A.D. Davis Construction Corporation –Applicant**  
**Sisters of St. Joseph – Owner**  
**241 St. George Street<sup>4</sup>**

**To remove and replace windows.**

Mr. Birchim said based on the review of information submitted by the applicant, the Architectural Guidelines for Historic Preservation and without support of evidence to the contrary, staff found that the Board could APPROVE the Certificate of Appropriateness application for replacing windows at 241 St. George Street provided that the following conditions were met:

- The five windows on the first floor elevation were sufficiently hidden from public view to be undistinguishable from the proposed vinyl windows, or if replacement windows were visible to the public, they should be replaced with wood

<sup>4</sup> Staff report attached to original minutes

- clad windows, with wood frame screens to hide the vinyl cladding
- The windows on the second and third stories replaced with the proposed vinyl window that matched the existing casement
- Replacement window sashes match color of the existing windows on the structure

Mike Davis, applicant, said the casement windows were replaced 13 years ago, due to sun and weather damage. He said the arches above the windows would remain; however, the casements would be replaced and painted to match the existing windows.

Mr. Smith questioned whether the windows would be custom painted by Anderson.

Mr. Davis replied that the windows would be custom painted by Anderson or painted on site.

Mr. Thomas asked if the sash was the only part of the window being replaced, and the response was affirmative.

Mr. Weeks suggested that the first floor and upper level styles be the same style including a true divided light with fixed glass above and interior screen. He questioned whether the divided light would be applied to the exterior of the windows and type of material that would be used.

Mr. Davis replied that the divided light would be applied using vinyl on the outside and wood on the inside.

Mr. Weaver questioned the life expectancy of the vinyl product.

Mr. Davis replied that the windows had a 20 to 25 year life expectancy. He said most vinyl applications were applied to Intracoastal and beachfront properties, and they had no problems with the product.

Public hearing opened; however, there was no response.

Mr. Smith asked if the size reduction of the sash would change the appearance, and the response was no.

**MOTION**

**Mr. Thomas MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness application F2010-0039 as submitted for all three levels, including top and bottom first floor windows being opaque. Motion SECONDED by Mr. Weeks.**

**VOTE ON MOTION:**

**AYES: Thomas, Weeks, Smith,  
Weaver, Halback**

**NAYES: NONE**

**MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

Mr. Weeks asked if the applicant would be using opaque or clear windows on the first floor; opaque windows were used for privacy.

Mr. Davis replied that he would like the first floor to remain opaque.

Sister Nancy Keen said the first floor windows were opaque, and they would not be replaced.

**Item 3 (e) F2010-0045**

**Richard J. Parks –Applicant  
Donna Lee Parks – Owner  
18 St. George Street<sup>5</sup>**

**To remove a portion of a wall and install a gate.**

Mr. Birchim said based on the review of the AGHP, the materials submitted and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff found that the Board could TABLE the item unless a gate design could be presented to board that would be satisfactory. He said a gate design spanning between buildings would be appropriate.

---

<sup>5</sup> Staff report attached to original minutes

Donna Parks, applicant, asked to remove 24 inches of the wall and install a gate. She provided updated plans and a letter of approval from the adjacent property owner.

Mr. Halback questioned whether the gate hardware had been selected.

Ms. Parks replied that she was aware of the HARB guidelines and would prefer to install a locked gate.

**Exparte Communication:**

Mr. Weeks had a brief conversation with the applicant and adjacent property owner (Elaine Fraser), and he suggested using a black heart shape lock with a deadbolt.

Mr. Thomas said he had a brief conversation with the property owner.

Mr. Smith questioned whether the gate would swing in or out and whether the wall would back up to the pier.

Ms. Parks replied that the door would swing inward and back up to the column.

Public hearing opened; however, there was no response.

**MOTION**

**Mr. Weeks MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness application F2010-0045 to include black gate hardware and final selection be submitted to staff. Motion SECONDED by Mr. Thomas.**

**VOTE ON MOTION:**

**AYES: Weeks, Thomas, Weaver,  
Smith, Halback**

**NAYES: NONE**

**MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

**Item 3 (f) F2010-0042**

**W. Justin Reid, Casa Monica Hotel – Applicant**  
**The Flagler Resort Ltd. – Owner**  
**95 Cordova Street<sup>6</sup>**

**To paint trim on the building and install window awnings in the pool courtyard.**

Mr. Birchim said based on the review of the AGHP, staff found that the board could approve painting and awning installation at 95 Cordova Street. He stated that the following items were not detailed enough for a complete review:

- Proposed “wood infill shutters” on the recessed areas on the Cordova Street façade
- Proposed awning over Cordova Street main entrance doorway

Justin Reid, applicant, said the modifications to the Casa Monica hotel were as follows:

- Approved colors would be selected
- Terra Cotta color would be used on the exterior as a contrast to the building
- Insert three Casa Monica crests on the exterior of the building
- Black awnings to be added in the pool/courtyard area

Mr. Halback requested further details regarding the shutters. He asked whether the awnings would be installed along Cordova and King Street, and the response was no.

Mr. Reid replied that he would prefer tabling the shutters.

Mr. Weaver expressed concern about the faux paintings.

Mr. Weeks asked if the yellow coating would be applied to the inset of the building, and the response was affirmative.

Mr. Birchim said the original façade had been covered with decorative balconies.

Mr. Weaver said he had worked on the Federal Tax Credit for the original application for the property, and felt the overall color treatment would not be appropriate.

Mr. Smith asked for clarification regarding the two drawings and whether the two windows above the logo would have stacked crests, and he suggested centering the crest.

Mr. Reid replied that one drawing displayed the suggested items to be painted, and the other drawing displayed the final product. He noted that an appliqué would be added to the recessed crest.

Mr. Thomas said he felt the terra cotta color would not be appropriate for the building style and suggested the applicant visit the Zorayda Castle for additional style input; however, he felt that the gold color and crest would be acceptable.

Mr. Halback said he was in favor of the existing repainted items, crest, gold insets and gold painted letters.

Public hearing opened; however, there was no response.

Mr. Reid requested a vote for the crest, insets, and awnings around the pool.

Mr. Smith asked if the pool area currently had awnings, and the response was affirmative.

Mr. Reid clarified that the property currently had scalloped awnings. He questioned whether the clad windows could be repainted.

<sup>6</sup> Staff report attached to original minutes

Mr. Weeks replied that Anderson terratone products could be repainted; however, a vinyl paint product would be used for the sashes.

Mr. Halback said the applicant would need to speak with the window manufacture regarding painting the windows.

#### **MOTION**

**Mr. Weeks MOVED to TABLE the exterior painting details until June 17, 2010 and APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness application F2010-0042 to include gold lettering, awning around swimming pool, crest, and points above sign and table terra cotta paint color until the subsequent meeting. Motion SECONDED by Mr. Weaver.**

#### **VOTE ON MOTION:**

**AYES: Weeks, Weaver, Smith, Thomas, Halback**

**NAYES: NONE**

**MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

#### **Item 3 (g) F2010-0044**

**Martha Graham, City of St. Augustine – Applicant**  
**City of St. Augustine – Owner**  
**Aviles Street (King Street to Artillery Lane)**<sup>7</sup>  
<sup>8</sup>

**To install landscaping features, expand sidewalks, install light fixtures and banners.**

Mr. Birchim said based on the review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff found that the board could approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as submitted.

Mr. Halback recused himself due to a conflict of interest.

<sup>7</sup> Staff report attached to original minutes

<sup>8</sup> Break 3:55 p.m. to 4:04 p.m.

Martha Graham, Public Works Department Director, introduced Jeremy Marquis of Halback Design Group.

Mr. Marquis provided a recap of the history of Aviles Street. He said an Opinion of Appropriateness had been approved in August 2009, and he was currently seeking approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness. He said the following improvements would be made to the Aviles Street Project:

- Underground electricity
- Five palm trees planted at the entrance
- Construction would be stopped south of Artillery Lane
- Four-sided light fixture that would include hanging baskets
- Black powder coated metal slat for the benches
- Black powder coated trash receptacles
- Planters located at the entrance
- Variety of Café table and chairs

Mr. Marquis said he would like to add a dumpster enclosure in the Trinity Parking lot similar to the City Marina's.

Mr. Weaver questioned whether citrus plantings would be added along Aviles Street, and the response was no.

Mr. Smith questioned the type of brick paver to be used, location of the irrigation controller, and upgraded light fixtures in church parking lot.

Mr. Marquis replied that the existing bricks would be replaced and additional bricks would be fired bricks. He said the irrigation controller would be located on the courtyard adjacent to the Spanish Military hospital, and the church had worked with FPL to change the street light covers.

Public hearing opened; however, there was no response.

Mr. Smith questioned the traffic route for Aviles Street and Artillery Lane.

Mr. Marquis replied that traffic along Aviles Street would travel south and west along Artillery Lane.

### **MOTION**

**Mr. Thomas MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness application F2010-0044. Motion SECONDED by Mr. Smith.**

### **VOTE ON MOTION:**

**AYES: Thomas, Smith, Weeks, Weaver**

**NAYES: NONE**

**MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

### **Item 3 (h) F2010-0043**

**Dana Ste. Claire & Martha Graham - City of St. Augustine—Applicant**  
**State of Florida – Owner**  
**29 St. George Street<sup>9</sup>**

**To install paving, landscaping and fencing.**

Mr. Birchim said based on the review of information submitted, staff found that the board could APPROVE a Certificate of Appropriateness for landscaping improvements to the Spanish Quarter Museum.

Mr. Halback and Mr. Thomas recused themselves due to a conflict of interest.

Jeremy Marquis said he would be providing an overview of the landscaping plans and fencing. He said various plantings, including vegetables and fruit trees would be planted. He said modifications had been

<sup>9</sup> Staff report attached to original minutes

made to the fencing and copies were provided.

Mr. Smith asked for clarification regarding the different fencing types. He asked if the fencing proposal was based on the Manucy sketches and whether the wood could be treated, and the response was affirmative.

Mr. Marquis said the fencing types were as follows:

### **Eastside:**

- Trolley stop would have pale stake fencing
- Removal of existing brick wall and board fence

### **De Mesa Sanchez House:**

- Board fencing

### **Near the Fort:**

- Pail and stake fencing

### **Other:**

- Gates would be pale stake with cross members

Mr. Weeks questioned whether further research had been completed for the Purvis concrete.

Mr. Marquis replied that the cost for adding stormwater drains and coquina would be costly. He said the roadway would be coquina tabby, and the remainder would be gravel paved.

Public hearing opened; however, there was no response.

### **MOTION**

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness application F2010-0043 as submitted. Motion SECONDED by Mr. Smith.

**VOTE ON MOTION:**

**AYES:** Weaver, Smith, Weeks

**NAYES:** NONE

**MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

Mr. Smith questioned whether the existing arbor would be reduced, and the response was affirmative.

**4. Planning and Building Director's Report**

(NONE)

**5. Other Business**

**Item 5 (b) Discussion of Ordinance 2010-11 (Amending the Architectural Standards for zoning district HP-1)**

Mr. Knight said that after review the Planning and Zoning board approved Ordinance 2010-10 and moved to return 2010-11 to the Historic Architectural Review Board for further discussion. He said 2010-11 had a variety of designs as follows:

- Gothic Revival – 1
- Empire – 1
- Carpenter Gothic – 1
- Mediterranean Baroque – 1
- St. Augustine Colonial Revival – 1
- Italianate – 1

Mr. Knight said each architectural style would need to have a developed guideline that would include site design, characteristic, location, and to what depths the board would like architectural styles in HP-1.

After discussion the board decided that staff would bring additional information to a future meeting.

**6. Review of Conflict Statements from Previous Meetings**

(NONE)

**7. Adjournment**

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:04 P.M.<sup>10</sup>

---

**Fred Halback, Chairperson**

---

<sup>10</sup> Transcribed by Carly Mason